Navigating Difficult Conversations: Strategies for Engaging Students in Social Issue Discussions

Part 2

Welcome!

Please use the chat box to introduce yourself and where you teach.
Two-Box Induction or Find My Rule

• I am going to sort a number of statements into either category “A” or category “B”
• It will be your job to define the pattern
• Why are some statements in “A” and others in “B”? 
What is the pattern?

- Collaborative
- Enlarges one’s point of view
- Searches for agreement

- Oppositional
- Re-affirms one’s point of view
- Searches for differences
What is the pattern?

- Collaborative
  - Enlarges one’s point of view
  - Searches for agreement
  - Calls for temporary suspending one’s own beliefs

- Oppositional
  - Re-affirms one’s point of view
  - Searches for differences
What is the pattern?

- Collaborative
  - Enlarges one’s point of view
  - Searches for agreement
  - Calls for temporary suspending one’s own beliefs

- Oppositional
  - Re-affirms one’s point of view
  - Searches for differences
  - Invests wholeheartedly in one’s own beliefs
What is the pattern?

- Collaborative
  - Enlarges one’s point of view
  - Searches for agreement
  - Calls for temporary suspending one’s own beliefs

- Oppositional
  - Re-affirms one’s point of view
  - Searches for differences
  - Invests wholeheartedly in one’s own beliefs
  - Listen to respond
What is the pattern?

• Collaborative
• Enlarges one’s point of view
• Searches for agreement
• Calls for temporary suspending one’s own beliefs
• Listen to understand

• Oppositional
• Re-affirms one’s point of view
• Searches for differences
• Invests wholeheartedly in one’s own beliefs
• Listen to respond
What is the pattern?

- Collaborative
- Enlarges one’s point of view
- Searches for agreement
- Calls for temporary suspending one’s own beliefs
- Listen to understand
- Open-ended

- Oppositional
- Re-affirms one’s point of view
- Searches for differences
- Invests wholeheartedly in one’s own beliefs
- Listen to respond
What is the pattern?

- Collaborative
- Enlarges one’s point of view
- Searches for agreement
- Calls for temporary suspending one’s own beliefs
- Listen to understand
- Open-ended

- Oppositional
- Re-affirms one’s point of view
- Searches for differences
- Invests wholeheartedly in one’s own beliefs
- Listen to respond
- Conclusive
Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases

Column A or Column B
What is the pattern?

• Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases
Assumes that many people have pieces of the answer and together, a workable solution can be found.

Column A or Column B
What is the pattern?

• Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases

• Assumes that many people have pieces of the answer and together, a workable solution can be found.
Causes a critique of other positions

Column A or Column B
What is the pattern?

• Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases

• Assumes that many people have pieces of the answer and together, a workable solution can be found.

• Causes a critique of other positions
“Winning” is the goal.

Column A or Column B
What is the pattern?

- Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases
- Assumes that many people have pieces of the answer and together, a workable solution can be found.

- Causes a critique of other positions
- “Winning” is the goal
One submits their best thinking and defends it against challenges.

Column A or Column B
What is the pattern?

• Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases

• Assumes that many people have pieces of the answer and together, a workable solution can be found.

• Causes a critique of other positions
  • “Winning” is the goal
  • One submits their best thinking and defends it against challenges.
Tries to understand and empathize with the lived experiences of others.

Column A or Column B
What should we title the columns?

- Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases
- Assumesthat many people have pieces of the answer and together, a workable solution can be found.
- Tries to understand and empathize with the lived experiences of others.

- Causes a critique of other positions
- “Winning” is the goal
- One submits their best thinking and defends it against challenges.
Student Voice
Dialogue vs. Debate

• Causes introspection on one’s own implicit biases

• Assumes that many people have pieces of the answer and together, a workable solution can be found.

• Tries to understand and empathize with the lived experiences of others.

• Causes a critique of other positions

• “Winning” is the goal

• One submits their best thinking and defends it against challenges.
Two-Box Induction or Find My Rule

- Artifacts (primary vs. secondary courses)
- Quotes (Tesla vs. Edison)
- Examples and Non-Examples (fact vs opinion)
- Manipulatives
What does an engaging and productive social issue discussion look like, feel like and sound like?
Planning for a Successful Current and Societal Issue Discussion

1. Create the climate for discussion
2. Give students tools collaboration and cooperation
3. Pick an open issue
4. Pick the right strategy
5. Craft your prompt
6. Use a formative assessment to reflect and set new goals individually and as a class
Reflect on the Past to Inform the Present

Take time to have students reflect on their experiences, have a voice in recalibrating classroom practices to create routines for success and engage in a collective renewal of goals for the year. Then, repeat throughout the year.
Create a Safe Space in Troubling Times

When current events take center stage, help students process, curate information and answer questions. It is NOT the time for debate.
Engage Students Voice in Creating Norms

How should we live together?
Dialogue vs. Debate
Build Your Classroom Community with Intention

#MaslowBeforeBloom
Teach for and with Cooperation & Collaboration

- Question Starters
- Transitions
- Active Listening
- Sentence Starters
  - Corroborate
  - Counterclaim
  - Dig Deeper
Engaging Student Voice with Formative Assessment is IMPERATIVE
Planning for a Successful Current and Societal Issue Discussion

1. Create the climate for discussion
2. Give students tools collaboration and cooperation
3. Pick an open issue
4. Pick the right strategy
5. Craft your prompt
6. Use a formative assessment to reflect and set new goals individually and as a class
## Start with an Open Issue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Open Issue</th>
<th>Settled Issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>● Matters of live controversy with multiple competing views</td>
<td>● There is broad-based agreement that a particular decision is well-warranted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Experts disagree on what conclusion to draw from competing evidence.</td>
<td>● There is sufficient evidence to support the agreed upon answer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● The current policy is considered non controversial to rational people.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Start with an Open Issue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Open Issue Examples</th>
<th>Settled Issue Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>● Should the voting age be lowered to 16 for local elections?</td>
<td>● Should women be allowed to vote?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Should we arm teachers to keep students safe?</td>
<td>● Was Japanese Internment justified?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Should the federal income tax be replaced by a national consumption tax?</td>
<td>● Did the Holocaust occur?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● In the system of federalism, who is best situated for mitigating climate change</td>
<td>● Is climate change occurring?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(local, state, federal)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reasonable Disagreement

“In this space, this is a settled issue.”

Wayne Journell
UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA AT GREENSBORO
Where to start...

- Do not seek out controversy for the sake of controversy.
Planning for a Successful Current and Societal Issue Discussion

1. Create the climate for discussion
2. Give students tools collaboration and cooperation
3. Pick an open issue
4. **Pick the right strategy**
5. Craft your prompt
6. Use a formative assessment to reflect and set new goals individually and as a class
Providing Structure to Achieve Your Goal

Matching Your Issue and Objective with the Right Strategy
Be clear on the goal of the discussion

Discussion can be used to build consensus, clarify understanding, promote exploration of complex issues, and build empathy for the lived experiences of others.
Teacher Disclosure

To what extent should teachers share their views on current and societal issues being deliberated in the classroom?

Consistently
Sometimes
Not sure
Rarely
Never

Briefly explain your view in the chat box
Human Barometer

1. Give students individual think time to respond to the prompt
2. Students “Take a Stand”
   a. physically move to take a position
   b. use post it notes or digital tools
3. Students share perspectives, acknowledging the comments of others
4. Students are encouraged to be flexible thinkers and move if position changes
5. Debrief

**Iterations**: Four Corners or Philosophical Chairs

**Variations**: Forced Perspective, Assign a Perspective, [Human Barometer Online](https://illinoiscivics.org)
Rules of Engagement

• Listen to understand. This is NOT a debate, but a discussion.
• Summarize point of previous speaker before contributing your own view.
• When you speak, address ideas, not the people stating them.
• Use academic language to agree, disagree, ask a question, clarify an idea or add a new idea.
• If someone says something you agree with, or your position changes as the discussion progresses, you may change locations.
Human Barometer

Works best when:

- There are clear choices.
- The claims students use are based on evidence (logos).
- Students do not have a personal connection to the issue (ethos), as students may confuse the attempts of their peers to persuade them as attacks on their lived experience.
- The issue will not be emotionally charged for participants (pathos), so that they will not be upset by the persuasion of others.
Structured Academic Controversy

STRUCTURED - CONTROVERSY (diagram by Jesse Gentile)

Teacher assigns a topic with two opposing viewpoints.

Students pair off & research or write up pro/con presentations. (Each pair takes one side)

Each pair presents its position to the other (who silently take notes).

With notes as a guide, pairs switch roles & present the other viewpoint.

Pairs drop their positions, and generate a consensus report addressing the original question.
Rules of Engagement

- You do not have to agree with the perspective you are representing. Your role is to convey what you perceive to be their strongest points.
- When you are listening, take notes and jot down clarifying questions to ask at the end. Listen to understand, not respond.
- When positions are dropped, seek areas of agreement in consensus building. This is not a debate.
Structured Academic Controversy

Works best when:

- There are two clear perspectives, but room for compromise to build consensus.
- When building consensus, students can use text based evidence (logos) and their own lived experiences (ethos).
- Neither of the assigned perspectives would be morally objectionable for students to defend (pathos).
- Should NOT be used to deliberate settled issues (slavery, Japanese-Internment, separate but equal).
Big Paper Talk

• Students in small groups are given a text, prompt or image as a stimulus (could be the same or varied)
• Students silently reflect on the prompt and simultaneously provide questions, comments and observations.
  • post it notes
  • different color text
• Students silently respond to others in their small group
• Students then comment on other group’s “Big Paper”
• Students return to their paper and silence is broken
• Debrief as a large group

Variations: Gallery Walk, Small Paper Talk, Big Paper Talk Online
• What brings Americans together?
• What tears Americans apart?
Big Paper Talk- Teacher Disclosure

1. What is to be gained by teachers sharing their views in current and controversial issue discussions?
2. What are some of the potential pitfalls of teachers sharing their views in current and controversial issue discussions?
3. Are there some guidelines that teachers should follow if/when contributing their views on current and controversial issue discussions?
4. When should a teacher ABSOLUTELY intervene in a current and controversial issue discussion?
Big Paper Talk

Works best when:

- There are a wide array of perspectives
- Students can discuss and question the text/prompt to clarify their own understanding of the issue (logos) and how it relates to the lived experience of others (ethos) to build empathy (pathos).
- The topic may be more emotionally charged, as no one is attempting to persuade or compromise with others.
Planning for a Successful Current and Societal Issue Discussion

1. Create the climate for discussion
2. Give students tools collaboration and cooperation
3. Pick an open issue
4. Pick the right strategy
5. **Craft your prompt**
6. Use a formative assessment to reflect and set new goals individually and as a class
# Crafting Your Prompt

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Human Barometer</strong></th>
<th>The prompt should provide a binary choice to facilitate students to choose if they agree or disagree, supporting their choice with evidence.</th>
<th>Should the federal minimum wage be raised to $15 per hour?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Structured Academic Controversy</strong></td>
<td>The prompt should allow the participants to explore two sides to an issue, but have room for students to reach consensus.</td>
<td>To what extent should the federal minimum wage be changed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Big Paper Talk</strong></td>
<td>The prompt should be open and allow participants to provide textual evidence and experience to address the prompt and offer additional questions for discussion.</td>
<td>What responsibility does the federal government have to guarantee a living wage?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Quick Tip...

- Build “the muscles” before swimming into “deeper waters.”
Planning for a Successful Current and Societal Issue Discussion

1. Create the climate for discussion
2. Give students tools collaboration and cooperation
3. Pick an open issue
4. Pick the right strategy
5. **Craft your prompt**
6. Use a formative assessment to reflect and set new goals individually and as a class
Engaging Student Voice with Formative Assessment is IMPERATIVE
Teacher Disclosure

To what extent should teachers share their views on current and societal issues being deliberated in the classroom?
How does a teacher address her own privilege and prejudices on race and share those uncomfortable insights with students?

- Anti Racism ToolKit for Parents
- Anti-Racism Toolkit for Classrooms
- Blog recapping series and links to webinars.
How does a white teacher introduce these conversations among African American students from disadvantaged backgrounds?
How can we engage 8th graders in community-based research about local environmental racism? What resources for middle school? Citizen Science?
How can we engage 8th graders in community-based research about local environmental racism? What resources for middle school? Resources for Citizen Science?

- IllinoisCivics.org Curriculum Design Toolkit- Service Learning with Infomred Action
  - What Kind of Citizen During a Pandemic?
- PBL Works
- National Geographic Geo-Inquiry
- National Youth Leadership Council
Current and Controversial Issue Discussions

Module 1- Orientation
Module 2- The What and Why
Module 3- The How
Module 4- Overcoming Obstacles
Module 5- Create a Plan of Action

Model Best Practices in Online Learning
Guardians of Democracy

GUARDIANS OF DEMOCRACY

Putting Proven Pedagogy Into Practice

LEARN MORE

IllinoisCivics.org

North American Association for Environmental Education
Lingering Questions?
Navigating Difficult Conversations: Strategies for Engaging Students in Social Issue Discussions

Part 2


Mary Ellen Daneels, Instructional Specialist, Illinois Civic Mission Coalition

@daneels_m